C. Tadhunter

AGN feedback: when, how, and how much?

Despite that general importance for understanding the evolution of massive galaxies, we still understand relatively little about AGN-driven outflows and the impact they have on their host galaxies. Concentrating on samples radio-loud AGN, I will review the following aspects: the triggering and timing of AGN activity; the link between AGN and starbursts; the observational evidence for AGN outflows; and the energetic significance of AGN-induced outflows compared with those driven by starbursts.

AGN outflows: how, when, and how much?

Clive Tadhunter University of Sheffield

Collaborators: J. Holt, K. Inskip, R. Gonzalez Delgado, D.Batcheldor, R. Morganti, M. Villar Martin, D. Dicken, J. Rodriguez Zaurin

Activity and galaxy evolution



Activity and galaxy evolution



Triggering?

Activity and galaxy evolution



Triggering?

Feedback?

Star formation in major gas-rich mergers



Springel et al. (2005)

• Sub-element microphysics (feedback, star formation, eqn. of state etc.)

- Sub-element microphysics (feedback, star formation, eqn. of state etc.)
- Resolution: the resolutions of most of the simulations relatively poor (~100pc); they do not cover key aspects of AGN physics

- Sub-element microphysics (feedback, star formation, eqn. of state etc.)
- Resolution: the resolutions of most of the simulations relatively poor (~100pc); they do not cover key aspects of AGN physics
- The proportion of the available accretion energy that goes into the quasar ouflows (the "coupling efficiency": ~0.005 -- 0.1P_{acc})

AGN feedback: key questions

- How and when are AGN triggered in the course of galaxy evolution?
- Are AGN and starbursts always triggered concurrently?
- What is the observational evidence for AGN-induced outflows?
- How energetically significant are AGNinduced outflows?

Triggering AGN: how and when?

Deep Gemini imaging of the 2Jy sample



The diversity of morphologies observed in powerful radio galaxies suggests that AGN can be triggered at a variety of stages in galaxy interactions (Ramos Almeida et al. 2010).















Cox et al. (2008)

Starbursts in radio galaxies: occurrence

- Starburst rate from optical spectroscopy:
 - 2Jy(0.15 < z < 0.7): <u>20 -- 35%</u> (22 objects) Tadhunter et al. (2002)
 - 3CR(z<0.2): <u>33%</u> (14 objects) Aretxaga et al. (2001), Wills et al. (2002)
 - 2Jy (z<0.08, FRIs): <u>25%</u> (12 objects) Wills et al. (2004)
- Far-IR continuum excess+MFIR colours+PAH:
 - 2Jy(0.05 < z < 0.7): <u>15--35%</u> Dicken et al. (2009,2010)

Starbursts in radio galaxies: occurrence

- Starburst rate from optical spectroscopy:
 - 2Jy(0.15 < z < 0.7): <u>20 -- 35%</u> (22 objects) Tadhunter et al. (2002)
 - 3CR(z<0.2): <u>33%</u> (14 objects) Aretxaga et al. (2001), Wills et al. (2002)
 - 2Jy (z<0.08, FRIs): <u>25%</u> (12 objects) Wills et al. (2004)
- Far-IR continuum excess+MFIR colours+PAH:
 - 2Jy(0.05 < z < 0.7): <u>15--35%</u> Dicken et al. (2009,2010)

The lack of major starburst components in the majority of powerful radio galaxies (> 65%) demonstrates that, while the activity may be triggered in galaxy interactions, in most cases it is not triggered at the peaks of major, gas-rich mergers.

The post-starburst radio galaxy 3C305



The post-starburst radio galaxy 3C305

3C305 (z=0.042) Heckman et al. 1986

The post-starburst radio galaxy 3C305



Starburst dominated objects: the ULIRG 3C459



The Ages of the YSP in ULIRG and PRG



The Ages of the YSP in ULIRG and PRG



Typical maximum age of radio source

Stellar masses of starburst radio galaxies

Comparison of their stellar masses suggests that only the most massive ULIRGs are capable of becoming radio galaxies

(Masses based an models that assume a significant old stellar population)



The AGN contribution in ULIRGs



Despite being observed close to the peaks of major galaxy mergers, many ULIRGs do not show energetically dominant AGN components. This further suggests an intermittent gas supply.

• Strong evidence that radio-loud AGN are triggered in galaxy interactions

- Strong evidence that radio-loud AGN are triggered in galaxy interactions
- Some are triggered at the peaks of major gas-rich mergers and are associated with luminous young stellar populations (ULIRG-like)

- Strong evidence that radio-loud AGN are triggered in galaxy interactions
- Some are triggered at the peaks of major gas-rich mergers and are associated with luminous young stellar populations (ULIRG-like)
- But the majority are triggered at earlier or later stages of gas-rich mergers, by galaxy encounters, by minor mergers, or by mergers that are relatively gas poor

- Strong evidence that radio-loud AGN are triggered in galaxy interactions
- Some are triggered at the peaks of major gas-rich mergers and are associated with luminous young stellar populations (ULIRG-like)
- But the majority are triggered at earlier or later stages of gas-rich mergers, by galaxy encounters, by minor mergers, or by mergers that are relatively gas poor

This diversity is likely to reflect the fact that sufficient fuel can be delivered to the nuclear regions at several stages during galaxy interactions of various types.

Feedback mechanisms

Powerful radio galaxies: energetics

Radiation

Quasar luminosity: $10^{44} - 10^{47}$ erg s⁻¹ Luminosity integrated over lifetime: $10^{57} - 10^{62}$ erg

Jets

Jet power: $10^{43} - 10^{47}$ erg s⁻¹ Jet power integrated over lifetime: $10^{57} - 10^{62}$ erg

• Winds

Total wind power: $\sim 0.005 - 0.1P_{ac}$? Wind power over lifetime: $10^{56} - 10^{61}$ erg?

Comparison: Luminosity of hot ISM in a cluster: $10^{44} - 10^{45}$ erg s⁻¹ Grav. binding energy of gas in spiral: $10^{58} - 10^{60}$ erg

Relativistic outflows ("radio mode")

Cygnus A: impact of jets on hot ICM

Chandra X-ray image (Wilson et al. 2006)
Cygnus A: impact of jets on hot ICM



Chandra X-ray image (Wilson et al. 2006)

Cygnus A: impact of jets on hot ICM



Chandra X-ray image (Wilson et al. 2006)

Cygnus A: impact of jets on hot ICM



Chandra X-ray image (Wilson et al. 2006)

$$\dot{M} \sim 10^4 M_{sun} yr^{-1}$$
 $\dot{E} \sim 4 \times 10^{45} erg/s$
 $\dot{E} / L_{edd} \sim 10^{-2}$

Radio-excavated cavities in the X-ray haloes of low luminosity radio sources





MS0735.6+7421 McNamara et al. (2005)

Perseus A Fabian et al. (2003)

Energies associated with the X-ray cavities and shocks: $\sim 10^{59} - 10^{62}$ erg

A massive outflow associated with the jet-cloud interactions in 3C171 (z=0.231)



Fight Ascension (J2000)

Halpha TTF Image with 6cm Radio Overlayed

WHT+ISIS Spectrum



A massive outflow associated with the jet-cloud interactions in 3C171 (z=0.231)



Fight Ascension (J2000)

Halpha TTF Image with 6cm Radio Overlayed

$$\dot{M} \sim 500 - 1000 M_{sun} yr^{-3}$$

$$\dot{E} \sim 10^{44} erg/s$$

$$\dot{E}/L_{edd} \sim 10^{-3}$$



Outflows in high redshift radio galaxies (z~2)





HI (21cm) Outflows in Nearby Radio Galaxies

- Broad blueshifted wings extending up to -2,000 km/s
- Significant mass outflow rates:

$$\dot{M} \sim 1.2 - 56 M_{sun} yr^{-1}$$

- There is clear observational evidence that the neutral outflows are jet-driven.

Morganti et al. (2005b), WRST with broadband capability

Fast HI 21cm outflow in 3C305: evidence for jet acceleration

13500



Near-nuclear outflows ("quasar mode")

The observational evidence for near-nuclear outflows in AGN



Narrow absorption line systems in AGN



- Detected in UV/X-ray spectra of ~60% of nearby type 1 AGN
- Absorbing gas has a high ionization state
- Absorption features strongly blueshifted (-2100 < Δ V < 0 km s⁻¹)
 - ➔ high ionization *outflows* close to the central AGN
- Radial scale: ~1 25pc
- Mass outflow rates relatively modest: M < 1 M_{sun}yr⁻¹ (but large uncertainties in radii, geometries, physical conditions of absorption line systems)

e.g. Crenshaw et al. (2003)

Cygnus A viewed by HST



Cygnus A viewed by HST





Outflows on a 1-3kpc scale in Cygnus A



Taylor et al. (2003)

Outflows on a 1-3kpc scale in Cygnus A



Taylor et al. (2003)

Outflows on a 1-3kpc scale in Cygnus A



Cygnus A: energetics

Jet and radiative power:

- Eddington luminosity: 3.3x10⁴⁷ erg s⁻¹
- Radiative bolometric luminosity: (0.5--2.0)x10⁴⁶ erg s⁻¹
- Moderate Eddington ratio: $L_{bol}/L_{edd} < 0.06$
- Jet power: ~(0.3-30)x10⁴⁶ erg s⁻¹

Outflows:

- Power in expanding cocoon (X-ray): 4x10⁴⁵ erg s⁻¹
- Power in emission line outflow (NLR): $2_{L_{kin}} 1 \mathcal{D}_{edd}^{41} \text{erg}_{0} \text{s}^{61}$

Warm outflows in Seyfert-like ULIRGs

Strongly blueshifted emission lines are common in nearby ULIRGs with optical Seyfert nuclei.

IEAS 12078-0444 BLAS 01004-3357 versiongth (Angetrane) wavelength (angetrans) DIAS 13305-1759 IEAS 14394+5338 vaniousts (aspress) warming to Lange-rectail IRAS 10120-1008 IEAS 16156+0146 ---sint and have the black store "smooth (Augriceas) warming to Canestromation DLAS 17179+5444 IRAJ 22023+2017 state when many some state ---workerath (Angelicens) wavelength (Angel/remail Fig. L.

Spoon et al. (2007, 2009) Rodriguez Zaurin et al. (2010)

PKS1549-79 (z=0.15): a proto-quasar in the local Universe

- Flat radio spectrum
- One-sided VLBI jet (radius ~420pc)
- Variability
- ULIRG -- as luminous as 3C273 in mid-IR
- Significant HI 21cm absorption



Holt et al. (2006)

Emission line kinematics in PKS1549-79



VLT+FORS1 Gunn r

Emission line kinematics in PKS1549-79



Holt et al. (2006)

The early stages of radio source evolution



The early stages of radio source evolution



HST/ACS images of PKS1549-79



WFC continuum image (5900A) $F_{OSR} < 10^{-17}$ erg s⁻¹ cm⁻² A⁻¹ Batcheldor et al. (2007)

Nature of the AGN in PKS1549-79

- Narrow line Seyfert 1 (FWHM(Pa α) < 2000 km/s)
- Black hole mass: $3.6 \times 10^7 2.4 \times 10^8 M_{sun}$
- (virial) (from M_r) • High Eddington ratio: $0.3 < L_{bol}/L_{edd} < 35$, typical of NLSy1 (but larger than many quasars which have $L_{bol}/L_{edd} < 0.1$)
- Relatively modest warm gas outflow: $0.12 < \dot{M} < 12 M_{sun} yr^{-1}$ $5.1 \times 10^{40} < \dot{E} < 5.1 \times 10^{42} erg s^{-1}$ $1.5 \times 10^{-6} < \dot{E} / L_{edd} < 1.5 \times 10^{-4}$

Holt et al. (2006)

Reasons for the (apparent) lack of energetic near-nuclear outflows

Reasons for the (apparent) lack of energetic near-nuclear outflows

 Possible that the energetically dominant outflow component has not yet been observed because it is in a hotter or cooler phase. (Are we really observing the piston?) Reasons for the (apparent) lack of energetic near-nuclear outflows

- Possible that the energetically dominant outflow component has not yet been observed because it is in a hotter or cooler phase. (Are we really observing the piston?)
- Is a large fraction of the near-nuclear outflow obscured at optical/UV wavelengths?

Massive, high ionization outflow in PDS456 (z=0.18)



Reeves et al. (2003)

- Radio quiet quasar
- X-ray absorption edge indicates a high velocity outflow ΔV~50,000 km/s

$$\dot{M} \sim 10 M_{sun} yr^{-1}$$
$$\dot{E} \sim 10^{46} erg/s$$
$$\dot{E} / L_{edd} \sim 0.1$$

(but large uncertainties in covering factor, geometry, radius etc..)

Outflow comparison

Neutral outflows in ULIRGs: a useful fiducial



Rupke et al. (2005a,b)

- Neutral outflows detected using NaID absorption in ~40 - 80% of nearby ULIRGs:
 - $-1200 < \Delta v < -100 \ km \ s^{-1}$ $10 < \dot{M} < 300 \ M_{sun} yr^{-1}$ $10^{40} < \dot{E} < 6 \times 10^{43} \ erg \ s^{-1}$
- But no significant differences are found between the neutral outflows detected in ULIRGs with and without powerful Seyfert nuclei...


























• <u>Triggering</u>: although radio galaxies are triggered in galaxy interactions, they are not solely triggered at a unique phase of a particular type of galaxy interaction

- <u>Triggering</u>: although radio galaxies are triggered in galaxy interactions, they are not solely triggered at a unique phase of a particular type of galaxy interaction
- <u>Jet-induced outflows:</u> have a major impact on the gas on all scales in host galaxies of AGN with powerful relativistic jets; they are likely to directly affect the star formation in the host galaxies and stop the hot ISM/ICM from cooling

- <u>Triggering</u>: although radio galaxies are triggered in galaxy interactions, they are not solely triggered at a unique phase of a particular type of galaxy interaction
- <u>Jet-induced outflows:</u> have a major impact on the gas on all scales in host galaxies of AGN with powerful relativistic jets; they are likely to directly affect the star formation in the host galaxies and stop the hot ISM/ICM from cooling
- <u>Near-nuclear AGN outflows ("quasar mode")</u>: despite the clear observational evidence for warm and cool nearnuclear outflows in a large fraction of nearby AGN, they are often much less powerful than required by the AGN feedback models, and less powerful than starburst-induced outflows

Cygnus A Chandra results (Young et al. 2002)



Cygnus A Chandra results (Young et al. 2002)



Evidence that the X-ray detected outflows are associated with the AGN

Outflow Velocity (km s-1



X-ray spectra of PG1211: evidence for a variable FeK absorption feature. New estimates of the outflow velocities don't show such good agreement with the galaxy recession velocities...

104

Recession Velocity (km s=1

105

Reeves et al. (2008)

The black hole in Cygnus A



$$M_{bh} = (2.5 \pm 0.7) \times 10^9 \,\mathrm{M_{sun}}$$

$$L_{bol}/L_{edd} < 0.06$$

Tadhunter et al. (2003)

Merger sequence for starburst radio galaxies



Objects with v.young starburst components

PKS0023-26 (z=0.340) - VLT/FORS2



YSP age: 30Myr Reddening: E(B-V)=0.8 YSP mass proportion: 9%

Holt et al. (2007)

These objects have:

- Low UV polarization
- Relatively weak narrow lines
- No broad lines detected

PKS0409-75 (z=0.69) - VLT/FORS2



YSP age: 10Myr Reddening: E(B-V)=0.9 YSP mass proportion: 4%

Based on a detailed spectrosynthesis modelling of a sample of

Based on a detailed spectrosynthesis modelling of a sample of 22 radio galaxies with good evidence for YSP:

Based on a detailed spectrosynthesis modelling of a sample of 22 radio galaxies with good evidence for YSP:

Based on a detailed spectrosynthesis modelling of a sample of 22 radio galaxies with good evidence for YSP:

• 95% of starburst radio galaxies show signs of morphological disturbance (tidal tails, fans, shells, dust lanes, double nuclei etc.)

Based on a detailed spectrosynthesis modelling of a sample of 22 radio galaxies with good evidence for YSP:

- 95% of starburst radio galaxies show signs of morphological disturbance (tidal tails, fans, shells, dust lanes, double nuclei etc.)
- Young stellar populations (YSP) contribute a significant proportion of the total stellar masses (5-40%)

Based on a detailed spectrosynthesis modelling of a sample of 22 radio galaxies with good evidence for YSP:

- 95% of starburst radio galaxies show signs of morphological disturbance (tidal tails, fans, shells, dust lanes, double nuclei etc.)
- Young stellar populations (YSP) contribute a significant proportion of the total stellar masses (5-40%)
- The YSP are spatially extended -- they generally detected across the full extents of the host galaxies over which accurate measurements can be made (although brightest in the nuclei)

Two main groups of starburst radio galaxies

- <u>LIRG/ULIRG-like systems</u> ($t_{ysp} < 0.1$ Gyr)
 - Most have: $L_{[OIII]} > 10^{35}W$; $L_{ir} > 10^{11}L_{sun}$ - Radio source triggered quasi-simultaneously with starburst
- <u>Post-starburst systems</u> ($t_{ysp} > 0.2 \text{ Gyr}$)
 - Most have: $L_{[OIII]} < 10^{35} W; L_{ir} \le 10^{11} L_{sun}$

- Radio source triggered (or retriggered) a significant period after the starburst episode

PKS1549-79: Optical Spectrum



Radio–Optical Morphological Associations



Right Ascension (J2000)

PKS2250-41(z=0.310) [OIII]/6cm

-40°57'40"



Right Ascension (J2000)

3C171 (z=0.238) Halpha/6cm

Galaxy merger simulations

di Matteo et al. (2005)

Galaxy merger simulations

di Matteo et al. (2005)

Models require: L_{kin}~0.05-0.1L_{ed}

Galaxy merger simulations

di Matteo et al. (2005)

Models require: L_{kin}~0.05-0.1L_{ed}



Barthel (1989)

Intrinsic or local (Galactic) X-ray absorption?



McKernan et al. (2004)

CZ -->

Outflows in 3C265 (z=0.82)



Solorzano Innarea et al. (2002) Taurus Tunable Filter on WHT
Outflows in 3C265 (z=0.82)



Solorzano Innarea et al. (2002) Taurus Tunable Filter on WHT

Outflows in 3C265 (z=0.82)





Solorzano Innarea et al. (2002) Taurus Tunable Filter on WHT

Outflows in 3C265 (z=0.82)



Solorzano Innarea et al. (2002) Taurus Tunable Filter on WHT

Integral field spectroscopy of 3C265



Solorzano Innarea et al. (2003) WHT+Integral

Optical/near-IR continuum SED



Disk wind models of outflowing absorbers



What next?

- Neutral outflows: sensitive searches for neutral outflows in complete samples of AGN using NaID line
- Highly ionized warm/hot outflows: continuing searches at X-ray wavelengths, perhaps also using optical/IR coronal lines
- Most promising targets: ULIRGs, NLSy1 -objects with large Eddington ratio -- perhaps also the population of red quasars detected in near-IR surveys

• Neutral outflows in ULIRG/LIRGS:

• Jet-cloud interactions in radio galaxies:

• Warm outflows in radio galaxies (NLR):

• Neutral (HI) outflows in radio galaxies (NLR):

- Neutral outflows in ULIRG/LIRGS: $9 < \dot{M} < 316 \ M_{sun} yr^{-1}$ $4 \times 10^{-5} < \dot{E} / L_{edd} < 1 \times 10^{-2}$ $2 \times 10^{41} < \dot{E} < 6 \times 10^{43} erg \ s^{-1}$
- Jet-cloud interactions in radio galaxies:

• Warm outflows in radio galaxies (NLR):

• Neutral (HI) outflows in radio galaxies (NLR):

- Neutral outflows in ULIRG/LIRGS: $9 < \dot{M} < 316 \ M_{sun} yr^{-1}$ $4 \times 10^{-5} < \dot{E} / L_{edd} < 1 \times 10^{-2}$ $2 \times 10^{41} < \dot{E} < 6 \times 10^{43} erg \ s^{-1}$
- Jet-cloud interactions in radio galaxies: $10^{-6} < \dot{E} / L_{edd} < 2 \times 10^{-3}$
- $500 < \dot{M} < 1000 M_{sun} yr^{-1}$ $10^{44} < \dot{E} < 2 \times 10^{44} erg s^{-1}$

• Warm outflows in radio galaxies (NLR):

• Neutral (HI) outflows in radio galaxies (NLR):

- Neutral outflows in ULIRG/LIRGS: $9 < \dot{M} < 316 \ M_{sun} yr^{-1}$ $4 \times 10^{-5} < \dot{E} / L_{edd} < 1 \times 10^{-2}$ $2 \times 10^{41} < \dot{E} < 6 \times 10^{43} erg \ s^{-1}$
- Jet-cloud interactions in radio galaxies: $500 < \dot{M} < 1000 M_{sun} yr^{-1}$ $10^{-6} < \dot{E} / L_{edd} < 2 \times 10^{-3}$ $10^{44} < \dot{E} < 2 \times 10^{44} erg s^{-1}$
- Warm outflows in radio galaxies (NLR): $10^{-6} < \dot{E} / L_{edd} < 2 \times 10^{-5}$ $0.1 < \dot{M} < 12 M_{sun} yr^{-1}$ $5 \times 10^{40} < \dot{E} < 5 \times 10^{42} erg s^{-1}$
- Neutral (HI) outflows in radio galaxies (NLR):

- Neutral outflows in ULIRG/LIRGS: $9 < \dot{M} < 316 \ M_{sun} yr^{-1}$ $4 \times 10^{-5} < \dot{E} / L_{edd} < 1 \times 10^{-2}$ $2 \times 10^{41} < \dot{E} < 6 \times 10^{43} erg \ s^{-1}$
- Jet-cloud interactions in radio galaxies: $10^{-6} < \dot{E} / L_{edd} < 2 \times 10^{-3}$ $500 < \dot{M} < 1000 M_{sun} yr^{-1}$ $10^{44} < \dot{E} < 2 \times 10^{44} erg s^{-1}$
- Warm outflows in radio galaxies (NLR): $10^{-6} < \dot{E} / L_{edd} < 2 \times 10^{-5}$ $0.1 < \dot{M} < 12 M_{sun} yr^{-1}$ $5 \times 10^{40} < \dot{E} < 5 \times 10^{42} erg s^{-1}$
- Neutral (HI) outflows in radio galaxies (NLR): $1 < \dot{M} < 60 M_{sun}yr^{-1}$ $1 \times 10^{41} < \dot{E} < 2 \times 10^{43} erg s^{-1}$
- High ionization X-ray absorber in PDS456:

- Neutral outflows in ULIRG/LIRGS: $9 < \dot{M} < 316 M_{sun} yr^{-1}$ $4 \times 10^{-5} < \dot{E} / L_{edd} < 1 \times 10^{-2}$ $2 \times 10^{41} < \dot{E} < 6 \times 10^{43} erg s^{-1}$
- Jet-cloud interactions in radio galaxies: $10^{-6} < \dot{E} / L_{edd} < 2 \times 10^{-3}$ $500 < \dot{M} < 1000 M_{sun} yr^{-1}$ $10^{44} < \dot{E} < 2 \times 10^{44} erg s^{-1}$
- Warm outflows in radio galaxies (NLR): $10^{-6} < \dot{E} / L_{edd} < 2 \times 10^{-5}$ $5 \times 10^{40} < \dot{E} < 5 \times 10^{42} erg s^{-1}$
- Neutral (HI) outflows in radio galaxies (NLR): $1 < \dot{M} < 60 M_{sun}yr^{-1}$ $1 \times 10^{41} < \dot{E} < 2 \times 10^{43} erg s^{-1}$
- High ionization X-ray absorber in PDS456: $E/L_{edd} \sim 0.1$

 $\dot{M} \sim 10 \ M_{sun} yr^{-1}$ $\dot{E} \sim 10^{46} erg \ s^{-1}$

Black hole growth/feedback models: the quasar mode

- AGN and starbursts triggered in major galaxy mergers
- The black holes grow rapidly through merger-induced accretion; in some phases this accretion occurs at close to the Eddington rate
- The major black hole growth phase is obscured by the large concentration of dust/gas concentrated in the nucleus by the merger
- The AGN drive powerful outflows that remove the gas from the central regions and halt both star formation and further accretion
- The models require that ~5-10% of the accretion power of the AGN drives the winds
- (e.g. di Matteo et al. 2005, Hopkins et al. 2005)